

STAFF REPORT

DATE May 16, 2017
PLACE 50 W Gay St
TIME 3:00 pm

A CALL TO ORDER

B APPROVAL OF MINUTES

~3:01 Meeting Summary – April 18, 2017

C Applications for Certificate of Approval

~3:05 17-01-001C Address: 431 W Town St
Property Owner: Manhattan Project LLC
Applicant: Jonathan Barnes Architecture and Design
To be reviewed: Parking modifications

Sub-Districts: West Broad St **Arts and Innovation** Dodge Park

Code Reference: 3323.21 Development Standards

Staff Observations:

The applicant received approval for Lucas Lofts phase II in January 2017. The approval included a parking modification to 187 spaces for the entire mixed use development, including; Lucas Loft phase I & II, 400 W Rich St, and 401 W Town St. In the current submittal, the applicant is requesting an additional modification of 6 parking spaces, bringing the total parking spaces provided to 181 in order to accommodate City of Columbus parking lot standards.

Applicable Code Development Standards:

Standard	Art and Innovation District	Staff Comments
Parking, stacking, circulation	Not permitted between the principle building and right-of-way	Consistent
Parking Mixed use development: Lucas Lofts phase I & II 401 W Town 400 W Rich	Entire mixed use development previously approved for 187 spaces	181 total spaces Modification of 6 parking spaces

The applicant's request for a parking reduction is consistent with the recommendations of the East Franklinton Creative Community District Plan. The plan recommends parking reductions may be appropriate for higher density, mixed use projects and encourages a dense, walkable, mixed-use development pattern. Staff recommends approval for parking modification of 6 additional spaces.

If approved, the Board will grant the following modifications to the East Franklinton Development Standards:

- To reduce the minimum parking setback from 5' to 3' (as shown on site plan)

Staff Recommendation:

Approval

Approval with
Conditions

Table

Disapproval

Address: 491 West Broad Street
 Property Owner: A.D. Farrow
 Applicant: Blostein/Overly Architects
 To be reviewed: New Construction

Sub-Districts:

West Broad St

Arts and Innovation

Dodge Park

Code Reference:

3323.19 Uses

3323.21 Development Standards

Staff Observations:

491 West Broad Street is an approximately 1 acre site located on three parcels spanning from S. May Ave to McDowell St. The site is currently occupied by the A.D. Farrow Co., a Harley-Davidson motorcycle dealership. The existing 15,946 SF building consists of a showroom (8946 SF), offices (1000 SF) and storage space (6000 SF). The applicant proposes a 9,400 SF addition to the existing structure for a new showroom (3420 SF), offices (5850 SF) and service center (5560 SF). An existing surface parking lot with 53 spaces is located at the rear of the property. In addition to the building expansion, the applicant is proposing to renovate and restripe the existing parking area to accommodate additional parking spaces, to improve the existing building façade to incorporate the new addition, and new landscaping features. Please note that the graphics included with this application are conceptual and for reference purposes only. The applicant will return to the Board at a later date for review and approval of their graphics.

Applicable Code Land Use Standard:

Standard	Broad Street Sub-District	Staff Comments
Car and truck sales	Permitted Use	Consistent
Auto Repair	Permitted Use	Consistent
Warehousing, not to exceed 10,000 SF	Permitted Use	Consistent
Office greater than 5,000 SF	Permitted Use	Consistent

Applicable Code Development Standards:

Standard	Broad Street Sub-District	Staff Comments
Minimum Front Yard Maximum Front Yard	0' 15' (For up to 50% of the building frontage)	Consistent
Minimum Parking Setback	5'	Requesting 0' setback
Minimum Side Yard	0'	Consistent
Minimum Fence/Wall Setback	0'	N/A
Minimum Rear Yard	0'	N/A
Minimum Building Frontage	60%	Consistent
Maximum Bldg Height	5 stories or 60'	Consistent
Building Frontage	All Buildings shall front on Public street	Consistent
Lighting	3323.21	TBD
Graphics	3323.21	TBD
Parking	Not permitted between the principle building and right-of-way.	Consistent
Parking	Required Parking Existing uses = 41 New = 36 Total = 77 spaces Bicycle parking required = 6	Applicant providing 72 parking spaces. Requesting a modification of 5 parking spaces No bicycle parking proposed
Landscaping and screening	3312.21	No interior shade trees or perimeter landscaping for the parking lot
Landscaping and screening	3312.03	A portion of the parking lot is on a separate parcel

Applicable Plan Land Use Recommendation:

Standard	Broad Street Sub-District	Staff Comments
Urban Mixed Use	Retail uses are appropriate throughout the neighborhood, consistent with the East Franklinton plan, provided code requirements are met.	Consistent

Applicable Plan Development Standards:

Recommendation and Standard	Staff Comments
Land Use Compatibility	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When a proposed use is compatible with adjacent uses, it should be supported. 	Permitted by code
Architecture—Mixed-Use, Commercial, Multifamily and institutional buildings	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Architecture should be provided that establishes and defines a building's appeal and enhances the industrial character of East Franklinton. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Historic and other contributing buildings should be preserved to the extent possible and if necessary, incorporated into new development. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> New construction should be integrated with the existing fabric and scale of development in surrounding neighborhoods. 	Consistent. Some elements of the building encroach into the R/W. Staff recommend that the applicant work with Public Service for approvals
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A wide range of architectural styles are appropriate for East Franklinton, with preference for contemporary building design and materials. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> All sides of a building should be coherently designed and treated. A consistent level of detailing and finish should be provided for all sides of a building ("foursided" architecture). 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Building frontages that exceed 50 feet in width should consider using vertical piers or other vertical elements, spaced at intervals of 15 feet to 30 feet along the entire building elevation. 	Consistent
Retail	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Retail uses are appropriate throughout the neighborhood, consistent with the East Franklinton plan, provided applicable code requirements are met. 	Consistent
Parking	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Surface parking should be located to the rear or side of street-oriented buildings, with preference for the rear of buildings and screened per code. The use of pervious surfaces for surface parking is encouraged to minimize storm water runoff and increase infiltration. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The minimum setback for parking lots is five feet; parking located adjacent to a public sidewalk, however, can be located closer than five feet, provided that it fully meets all screening requirements. Parking lots and accessory buildings should be located at the rear of the principal building. Where access to the rear of the property is not possible from a public alley or street, up to 50 percent of the parking may be located at the side of the principal building. 	Not Consistent. Staff recommends sufficient setback for screening.

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Parking reductions may be appropriate for higher density, mixed use projects. Shared parking arrangements may be appropriate. 	Consistent
Building Orientation and Setbacks	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Buildings should be located parallel to the street on which they front. The primary façade should be located on the major street abutting the building and the secondary façades should be located adjacent to secondary streets, service drives, and alleys. Buildings on corner lots should be oriented to the corner and to the street fronts, and should make a strong tie to the building lines of each street. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The minimum setback for a principal building is zero feet and the maximum setback for a principal building is ten feet, except where a Public-Private Setback Zone is provided. Where a Public-Private Setback Zone is provided, a maximum setback of 15 feet is permitted for up to 50 percent of the building frontage. 	Consistent
Buffering and Screening	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Roof-mounted mechanical units should be screened to their full height should complement the building in terms of color and materials. 	Additional information requested
Landscaping	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Landscape materials and design should enhance structures, create and define public and private spaces, and provide shade, aesthetic appeal, and environmental benefits. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Paved areas should be shaded, especially parking lots. 	Not consistent. Existing parking lot has no shade trees. Applicant encouraged to provide additional street trees and perimeter screening for the parking lot
Street Trees and Streetscape	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Street trees are recommended on all public and private streets, with species and spacing approved by the City of Columbus forester. 	Consistent. Staff recommends that the applicant consult with City Forester on appropriate location of street trees
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Tree-lined residential and commercial streets should be either established or maintained. 	Additional street trees recommended along McDowell
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Landscaping on private property bordering sidewalks should be designed with new elements, such as a new plant form or material, at a scale and intervals appropriate to the site. This is not intended to discourage a uniform street tree or landscape theme, but to add interest to the streetscape and enhance the pedestrian experience. 	Not consistent. Staff recommends that the applicant provide sufficient setback for perimeter landscaping along McDowell St to screen parking lot
Lighting	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Lighting should be appropriate to its location and utilized to enhance security and highlight distinguishing characteristics of buildings. 	Additional information requested
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Lights should have fully shielded, recessed lamps directed downward to prevent glare and shine above the horizontal plane. 	Additional information requested

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Light standards (poles) should not exceed 18 feet in height. 	Additional information requested
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Wall-mounted lights should be directed downward. Soffit-mounted light fixtures should be recessed in the soffit or otherwise fully shielded from view from any property line. 	Additional information requested
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Ground-mounted or other upward directional lighting should be permissible only where some form of shield or light baffling is provided to create a soft, uniform light quality and minimize light spillage beyond trees, landscaping, walls or signs being illuminated. 	Additional information requested
Transportation Network	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Existing street and alley grids should be maintained or reestablished. 	Not Consistent. Applicant proposing to remove alley. Staff is in support because alley is currently disconnected from existing street grid

The proposed development is generally consistent with the recommendations of the East Franklinton Creative Community District Plan (EFCCD), and the proposed uses are permitted within the Broad Street Sub-District. The plan recommends a minimum 5 ft. setback for parking lots with landscaping on private property bordering sidewalks. Staff recommends that the applicant provide less parking in order to provide space to screen the parking lot and plant additional street trees. The code requires 77 parking spaces, and the applicant is proposing 72. Staff would support the existing 54 parking spaces if screening is provided in accordance with the standards set forth in Chapter 3312.21 of City of Columbus Code.

Staff has requested additional information regarding exterior lighting, proposed lot combination/split, mechanical unit location and screening, dumpster screening and a landscape plan.

If approved, the Board will grant the following modifications to the East Franklinton Development Standards:

1. To reduce the minimum parking requirement from 77 to 72 spaces(5 space reduction)
2. To reduce the minimum bicycle parking requirement from 6 to 0
3. To reduce the minimum parking setback from 5' to 0'
4. To reduce the required number of parking lot shade trees from 8 to 0
5. To allow a parking lot to be located on a separate lot from the intended use

Staff Recommendation:

Approval

Approval with
Conditions

Table

Disapproval

1. Parking lot screening along McDowell streets per code requirements
2. Roof top mechanical units visible screened to full height
3. EFRB review and approval of materials, landscape plan, lot combination, lighting plan, and graphics plan

Address: 463 W Town Street
 Property Owner: Brewdog Franklinton LLC
 Applicant: Design Collective – Ryan Geiser
 To be reviewed: Change of Use, Exterior Modifications

Sub-Districts: West Broad St **Arts and Innovation** Dodge Park

Code Reference: 3323.19 Uses
 3323.21 Development Standards

Staff Observations:

463 W Town is located at the southeast corner of W Town and McDowell streets and is occupied by an existing one-story structure that is currently an auto repair shop. The property owner, Brewdog Franklinton LLC, is proposing a change of use from an auto repair shop to a restaurant/bar with an expansion that includes a rooftop patio/bar and an outdoor patio. The ground floor restaurant/bar is 4,194 SF, the outdoor patio is 1,775 sf, and the second floor addition (roof top patio) is 2,989 SF. The application includes exterior modifications to the existing building, including new window openings, replacement windows and painting the exterior. The applicant is requesting a 58 space parking modification to zero spaces due to site constraints. The new patio on Town Street extends into the right-of-way and will require approval by the Department of Public Service. The applicant is requesting conceptual review of graphics and will return for graphics approval in the future.

Applicable Code Land Use Standard:

Standard	Arts and Innovation	Staff Comments
Eating and Drinking Est.	Permitted Use	Consistent
Commercial patio/outdoor dining	Accessory Use	Consistent

Applicable Code Development Standards:

Standard	Art and Innovation District	Staff Comments
Minimum Front Yard	0'	Consistent
Maximum Front Yard	10' (Except public/private zone)	(DPS approval required for ROW encroachment)
Minimum Parking Setback	5'	Not applicable
Minimum Side Yard	0'	Consistent
Minimum Fence/Wall Setback	0'	DPS approval required for ROW encroachment
Minimum Rear Yard	0'	Consistent
Minimum Building Frontage	60%	Consistent
Maximum Bldg Height	5 stories or 60'	Consistent
Building Frontage	All Buildings shall front on Public street	Consistent
Lighting	3323.21	Consistent
Graphics	3323.21	To be reviewed on future date
Parking, stacking, circulation	Not permitted between the principle building and right-of-way	Not applicable
Parking	Eating/Drinking (25% reduction): 42 spaces Outdoor patio (25% reduction): 24 spaces Existing Use: 8 spaces/0 provided Total: 42+24-8 = 58 spaces	5 bicycle parking spaces 0 parking spaces

Applicable Plan Land Use Recommendation:

Standard	Arts and Innovation	Staff Comments
Neighborhood Mixed Use	16-45 du/acre	Consistent

Applicable Plan Development Standards:

Recommendation and Standard	Staff Comments
Land Use Compatibility	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> When a proposed use is compatible with adjacent uses, it should be supported. 	Permitted use by code
Architecture—Mixed-Use, Commercial, Multifamily and institutional buildings	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Architecture should be provided that establishes and defines a building's appeal and enhances the industrial character of East Franklinton. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> New construction should be integrated with the existing fabric and scale of development in surrounding neighborhoods. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A wide range of architectural styles are appropriate for East Franklinton, with preference for contemporary building design and materials. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> All sides of a building should be coherently designed and treated. A consistent level of detailing and finish should be provided for all sides of a building ("foursided" architecture). 	Roof mounted mechanical units should be screened to full height on west and south elevations.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Building frontages that exceed 50 feet in width should consider using vertical piers or other vertical elements, spaced at intervals of 15 feet to 30 feet along the entire building elevation. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Street-level facades are recommended to be as transparent as possible to create an attractive pedestrian environment, except for residential spaces on ground floors. For a primary façade, at least 60 percent of the first-floor wall area (between two feet and ten feet) should be clear/non-tinted window glass, which permits a view of the building's interior to a minimum depth of four feet. At least 25 percent of upper-floor wall areas should be clear/non-tinted window glass. 	Consistent
Retail	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Sidewalk dining should be supported that enhances restaurant, dining and entertainment businesses, provided ADA requirements are accommodated, per DPS approvals. 	Consistent
Parking	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Parking reductions may be appropriate for higher density, mixed use projects. Shared parking arrangements may be appropriate. 	Shared parking arrangement for evening and weekend hours is recommended.
Building Orientation and Setbacks	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Primary entrances to buildings should be oriented to the primary public street with at least one operable door on the primary public street. Buildings located at a corner should orient the main entrance to the corner instead of to one of the two abutting streets (only one operable door is necessary). 	Consistent

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Secondary entrances can be located on side and rear elevations to meet fire code and to service adjacent parking. 	Consistent
Buffering and Screening	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Roof-mounted mechanical units should be screened to their full height should complement the building in terms of color and materials. 	Units should be screened to full height
Landscaping	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Landscape materials and design should enhance structures, create and define public and private spaces, and provide shade, aesthetic appeal, and environmental benefits. 	Additional information requested Staff recommends elimination of curb cuts on Town Street and installation of new tree lawn
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Paved areas should be shaded, especially parking lots. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Public, semi-public/private, and private spaces should be demarcated clearly through the use of landscape, walls, fences, gates, pavement treatment, signs, and other methods to denote boundaries and/or buffers. 	Consistent
Street Trees and Streetscape	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Street trees are recommended on all public and private streets, with species and spacing approved by the City of Columbus forester. 	Consistent
Landscape Material	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> All trees (including street trees) should meet the following minimum size at the time of planting: shade trees 2 inches caliper; ornamental trees 1 1/2 inches caliper; and evergreen trees five feet in height. Tree caliper is measured six inches from the ground. 	Consistent
Lighting	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Lighting should be appropriate to its location and utilized to enhance security and highlight distinguishing characteristics of buildings. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Lights should have fully shielded, recessed lamps directed downward to prevent glare and shine above the horizontal plane. 	Additional information requested
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Light standards (poles) should not exceed 18 feet in height. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> For aesthetic compatibility, light standards should be of the same or similar type and color. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Lighting levels should provide sufficient illumination to ensure security, but without glare, hot spots, or light spillage through residential windows. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Where appropriate, lighting should highlight special architectural or landscape features and/or prominent buildings and gateways. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Wall-mounted lights should be directed downward. Soffit-mounted light fixtures should be recessed in the soffit or otherwise fully shielded from view from any property line. 	Additional information requested

<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Ground-mounted or other upward directional lighting should be permissible only where some form of shield or light baffling is provided to create a soft, uniform light quality and minimize light spillage beyond trees, landscaping, walls or signs being illuminated. 	Additional information requested
Transportation Network	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Off-street parking for bicycles should be provided per code. Major development should consider facilities beyond that required by code, such as bike lockers and water facilities. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Public sidewalk system should be maintained per code. 	Consistent
Graphic Design Guidelines	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A wide range of design styles are appropriate for East Franklinton, with preference for contemporary design and materials. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Signs that reinforce the creativity, craftsmanship, and industrial character of the East Franklinton District are encouraged. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Signage should be pedestrian in orientation and scale. Wall and blade signs are preferred. Auto-oriented signage is not appropriate for this district. The Review Board may consider auto-oriented signage requests featuring unique and artistic elements if such graphics are integral to the design of a building, development, and/or character of the sub-districts. 	Staff recommends reducing the size of the logo on the west side of the façade. While it is appropriate for the logo to be large, the proportions should be considered relative to the overall size of the structure.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> New signage should be designed to be a logical and complementary component of the overall design of a storefront and/or the associated building's architecture. 	Consistent
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Externally illuminated signs should only use light fixtures that prevent light spillage onto adjacent properties. 	Additional information requested regarding the illumination of the marquee sign.
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The width of building wall signs should not exceed 50 percent of the width of the structure. 	Consistent

Overall, the proposed change of use and exterior modifications are consistent with the recommendations of the East Franklinton Creative Community District Plan (EFCCD). The Plan recommends mechanical units are screened and that landscape materials and design should enhance structures, create and define public and private spaces, and provide aesthetic appeal. Based on these recommendations, staff recommends that the roof-mounted mechanical units are screened to full height and that two existing curb cuts on Town Street be eliminated and replaced with a tree lawn. Parking reductions promote the vision of the plan to create a dense, walkable neighborhood, and shared parking arrangements are recommended by the EFCCD Plan. Staff recommends the applicant pursue a shared parking arrangement to provide 15-20 spaces in the evenings and weekend hours.

Staff has requested additional information regarding light fixtures “B” and “E”, materials, landscaping and lot combination.

The graphics are presented for a conceptual review. Staff has requested information on the intensity of the marquee sign lights and recommends the logo on the façade be reduced in size.

If approved, the Board will be granting the following modifications to the East Franklinton Development Standards:

1. To reduce the minimum parking requirement from 58 spaces to 0 spaces.

Staff Recommendation:

Approval

Approval with
Conditions

Table

Disapproval

1. A shared parking arrangement is provided with 15-20 spaces
2. The applicant returns to the Board for review and approval of lot combination, landscape plan and any additional materials requested by the Board

D OTHER BUSINESS

E STAFF ISSUED CERTIFICATES OF APPROVAL

115 S Gift | Application #16-01-002 (Boys and Girls Club)

1. Change of Use | Reviewed 04/28/2017 | Issued 04/28/2017

F BOARD APPROVED APPLICATIONS ISSUED CERTIFICATES OF APPROVAL

72 S Gift | Application #15-07-003 (Time Tunnel)

1. New Construction | Reviewed 7/15/2015 | Issued 04/19/2017

G NEXT MEETING

Tuesday – June 20, 2017 at 50 W Gay St at 3:00 pm